

Supplementary Table 2. Key components of PBL and frequency

		Study number ¹⁾																	
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18
Key components	Incorporation of real-life problem	x ²⁾	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Collectiveness	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Solution formation	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Learner proactiveness	x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Evaluation	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Involvement of planning process	x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
	Facilitation by instructor	x		x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	
	Efficient time management						x	x		x									

¹⁾Table 1 includes details of each study of the assigned study number.

²⁾'x' indicates inclusion of component within study.

¹Zakaria, M. I., Maat, S. M., & Khalid, F. (2019). A Systematic Review of Problem Based Learning in Education. *Creative Education*, 10, pp. 2671-2688. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2019.1012194>

²Hallinger, P., & Bridges, E. M. (2017). A Systematic Review of Research on the Use of Problem-Based Learning in the Preparation and Development of School Leaders. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 53(2), pp. 255-288. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013161X16659347>

³dos Santos, S. C. (2017). PBL-SEE: An Authentic Assessment Model for PBL-Based Software Engineering Education. *IEEE Transactions on Education*, vol. 60, no. 2, pp. 120-126. doi: 10.1109/TE.2016.2604227.

⁴Tortorella, G., & Cauchick-Miguel, P. A. (2017). An initiative for integrating problem-based learning into a lean manufacturing course of an industrial engineering graduate program. *Production*, 27(spe), e20162247. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/0103-6513.224716>

⁵dos Santos, S., Alexandre, G., & Rodrigues, A. (2015). "Applying PBL in project management education: A case study of an undergraduate course," 2015 IEEE Frontiers in Education Conference (FIE), El Paso, TX, 2015, pp. 1-8. doi: 10.1109/FIE.2015.7344232.

⁶Salinitri, F. D., Wilhelm, S. M., & Crabtree, B. L. (2015). Facilitating Facilitators: Enhancing PBL through a Structured Facilitator Development Program. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, 9(1), pp. 73-82. <https://doi.org/10.7771/1541-5015.1509>

⁷Wosinski, J., Belcher, A. E., Dürrenberger, Y., Allin, A., Stormacq, C., Gerson, L. (2018). Facilitating problem-based learning among undergraduate nursing students: A qualitative systematic review. *Nurse Education Today*, 60(2018), pp. 67-74. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2017.08.015>

⁸Alrahlah, A. (2016). How effective the problem-based learning (PBL) in dental education. A critical review. *The Saudi Dental Journal* (2016) 28, pp. 155-161. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sdentj.2016.08.003>

⁹Jalienauskiene, E. (2016). Revitalizing Foreign Language Learning in Higher Education Using a PBL Curriculum. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 232 (2016), pp. 265-275. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.014.

¹⁰Almulla, M. A. (2019). The Efficacy of Employing Problem-Based Learning (PBL) Approach as a Method of Facilitating Students' Achievement. *IEEE Access*, vol. 7, pp. 146480-146494. doi: 10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2945811.

¹¹Huang, C., Wang, Y. (2020). Toward an Integrative Nursing Curriculum: Combining Team-Based and Problem-Based Learning with Emergency-Care Scenario Simulation. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 17, no. 12:4612. doi:10.3390/ijerph17124612.

¹²Hung, C., Lin, C. (2015). Using concept mapping to evaluate knowledge structure in problem-based learning. *BMC Medical Education* (2015) 15:212. doi: 10.1186/s12909-015-0496-x.

¹³Rodríguez González, C. A., & Fernández Batanero, J. M. (2016). A review of Problem-Based Learning applied to Engineering. *EduRe Journal: International Journal on Advances in Education Research*, 3 (1), pp. 14-31. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Cesar_Rodriguez_Gonzalez/publication/302152342_A_review_of_Problem-Based_Learning_applied_to_Engineering/links/572e6e2908aee022975a6076/A-review-of-Problem-Based-Learning-applied-to-Engineering.pdf

¹⁴Kang, J., Lee, H., Kim, J. (2019). The Effects of Application of PBL(Problem-Based Learning) Class on Nursing Education. *Journal of the Korean Applied Science and Technology* Vol. 36, No. 4, pp. 1460-1471. <http://dx.doi.org/10.12925/jkocs.2019.36.4.1460>

¹⁵Kim, S. (2018). Tutors' Content Expertise and Experience on Student Satisfaction in Problem-Based Learning Nursing Curriculum. *The Journal of the Korea Contents Association* 2018 Vol. 18, No. 7, pp. 551-559. <https://doi.org/10.5392/JKCA.2018.18.07.551>

- ¹⁶Kim, B. (2015). Applying Problem-Based Learning in University Business English Classes. *Journal of Digital Convergence* 2015 Feb; 13(2), pp. 91-103. <http://dx.doi.org/10.14400/JDC.2015.13.2.91>
- ¹⁷Shin, S., Kim, C. (2019). A Subjectivity Study of Culinary Arts Major Students in Problem Based Learning(PBL) Program for Culinary Competition. *The Journal of the Korea Contents Association* 2019 Vol. 19, No. 8, pp. 598-608. <https://doi.org/10.5392/JKCA.2019.19.08.598>
- ¹⁸Lee, M. (2017). Effects of PBL (Problem-Based Learning) on Academic Achievement and Job Essential Skills: Focused on Application Practices in Computer System Programming Education. *The Journal of Korean Association of Computer Education* Vol. 20, No. 3, pp. 1-11. Retrieved from <https://www.korea-science.or.kr/article/JAKO201718837035299.page>